



**THREE GATEWAY CENTER**  
100 Mulberry Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Newark, NJ 07102  
T: 973.757.1100  
F: 973.757.1090  
**WALSH.LAW**

Liza M. Walsh  
Direct Dial: (973) 757-1100  
[lwalth@walsh.law](mailto:lwalth@walsh.law)

October 8, 2024

**VIA ECF**

Honorable Leda D. Wettre  
United States Magistrate Judge  
U.S. District Court for the District of New Jersey  
Martin Luther King Jr. Bldg. & U.S. Courthouse  
50 Walnut Street  
Newark, New Jersey 07102

**Re: *United States of America, et al. v. Apple Inc.*, No. 2:24-cv-04055 (JXN-LDW)  
Response to Non-Party Samsung Electronics America, Inc.'s Response to  
Joint Letter re Disputes Over the Protective Order**

Dear Judge Wettre:

On September 27, 2024, Samsung Electronics America, Inc. ("Samsung") filed a letter responding to the Parties' Joint Letter on disputes over the Protective Order. That letter provides Samsung's views on certain disputes the parties have regarding the protective order to be entered in this action, and advocates for a more restrictive version of Apple's two-tiered confidentiality proposal. See Dkt. 123. As the parties noted in their October 3 letter, other third parties intend to submit their positions on the parties' proposed protective orders through an additional submission on October 8, 2024. See Dkt. 131. Because these arguments may create additional disputes and/or conflict with those put forth by Samsung—and because Apple has not had an opportunity to meet and confer with Samsung or any other third party—Apple requests that it be permitted to file an omnibus response to third parties' objections after the hearing on October 10<sup>th</sup> when Apple has had an opportunity review the submissions and to confer, as appropriate, with those parties. This approach will conserve judicial resources because the parties may be able to streamline the disputes through meeting-and-conferring, and an omnibus response will ensure that all third-party objections are presented to the Court at once. Apple will be prepared to discuss these issues and answer any questions at the October 10 status conference.

Plaintiffs do not object to Apple's efforts to resolve disputes with third parties over the Protective Order between now and the scheduled hearing on October 10, but do object to any further delay of decision on the Protective Order. Plaintiffs believe that the Court will be more than able to receive the submissions of the third parties, hear oral argument from the Plaintiffs, Defendant, and third parties, and reach a determination without additional briefing needed after the October 10 hearing. The Protective Order is a necessary step toward discovery. Further briefing and delay would be an inefficient use of the Court's and parties' resources.

Honorable Leda D. Wettre  
October 8, 2024  
Page 2

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jonathan H. Lasken

Assistant Chief, Civil Conduct Task Force  
United States Department of Justice  
450 Fifth Street, NW, Suite 8600  
Washington, D.C. 20530  
Telephone: (202) 598-6517  
Email: jonathan.lasken@usdoj.gov

PHILIP R. SELLINGER  
United States Attorney

/s/ J. Andrew Ruymann

J. Andrew Ruymann  
Assistant United States Attorney  
U.S. Attorney's Office  
402 East State Street, Room 430  
Trenton, NJ 08608  
Telephone: (609) 989-0563  
Email: John.Ruymann@usdoj.gov

MATTHEW J. PLATKIN  
Attorney General of New Jersey

/s/ Isabella R. Pitt

Isabella R. Pitt (NJ Bar No. 071002013)  
Deputy Attorney General  
Assistant Section Chief of Antitrust  
New Jersey Office of the Attorney General  
124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor  
Newark, NJ 07101  
Telephone: (973) 648-3070  
Isabella.Pitt@law.njoag.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of New Jersey,  
Arizona, California, Washington D.C.,  
Connecticut, Indiana, Maine,  
Massachusetts, Michigan, Minnesota,  
Nevada, New Hampshire, New York, North  
Dakota, Oklahoma, Oregon, Tennessee,  
Vermont, Washington, and Wisconsin*

/s/ Liza M. Walsh

Liza M. Walsh  
Douglas E. Arpert  
WALSH PIZZI O'REILLY FALANGA LLP  
Three Gateway Center  
100 Mulberry Street, 15th Floor  
Newark, New Jersey 07102  
Tel.: (973) 757-1100  
Email: lwalsh@walsh.law  
Email: darpert@walsh.law

*Attorneys for Defendant Apple Inc.*

cc: All Counsel of Record (via ECF and E-Mail)